



Curriculum Evaluation of Entrepreneurship Education: Employers' Feedback on Business Graduates' Job Performance

Gretchen Dawaton Bangguiyac¹, Daniel Pannogan², Sonia Belinan³, Karen Razelle Duyan⁴

^{1,2,3,4} College of Entrepreneurship, Tourism and Hospitality Management, Kalinga State University, Kalinga, Philippines

Article Info

Article history:

Received Oct 22, 2025

Revised Nov 9, 2025

Accepted Dec 16, 2025

Online First Dec 19, 2025

Keywords:

Curriculum Enhancement
Curriculum Evaluation
Educational Assessment
Employers' Feedback
Entrepreneurship Education
Higher Education
Accountability

ABSTRACT

Purpose of the study: This study aimed to evaluate employers' feedback on the job performance of Bachelor of Science in Entrepreneurship graduates of Kalinga State University (KSU) to identify strengths and areas for improvement across four competency domains: personal, interpersonal, intellectual, and technical. The findings serve as a basis for curriculum enhancement, instructional innovation, and career development initiatives, thereby reinforcing educational accountability and employability outcomes within the ASEAN context.

Methodology: The study employed a mixed-method research design integrating quantitative and qualitative approaches. A descriptive survey using a structured questionnaire distributed via Google Forms and in-person administration was utilized. Data was encoded in Microsoft Excel and analyzed using descriptive statistics such as frequency, percentage, weighted mean, and ranking, complemented by thematic analysis of employers' qualitative feedback.

Main Findings: Quantitative results indicated that graduates performed very satisfactorily in all four domains: personal abilities ($M = 4.32$), interpersonal abilities ($M = 4.15$), intellectual abilities ($M = 4.19$), and generic and specific knowledge and skills ($M = 3.92$). Employers commended graduates' persistence, teamwork, and creativity but emphasized the need to improve communication, leadership, and digital literacy. The qualitative results revealed four major themes: practical and experiential learning, communication and interpersonal development, technological and digital skills enhancement, and leadership and professional competence.

Novelty/Originality of this study: This study provides empirical evidence linking employer feedback with curriculum evaluation through the CIPP (Context–Input–Process–Product) Model, a framework rarely applied in Philippine entrepreneurship education research. It advances discourse on educational assessment and accountability by positioning employer perspectives as outcome-based indicators of curricular effectiveness. Moreover, it contributes to the ASEAN goal of promoting quality-assured, outcome-based, and employability-driven higher education that prepares graduates to be innovative, globally competent, and industry-responsive.

This is an open access article under the [CC BY](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) license



Corresponding Author:

Gretchen Dawaton Bangguiyac

College of Entrepreneurship, Tourism and Hospitality Management, Faculty of the Bachelor of Science in Entrepreneurship Program, Kalinga State University, Tabuk city, Kalinga, Philippines

Email: gcdawaton@ksu.edu.ph

1. INTRODUCTION

The global labor market continues to evolve due to the accelerating pace of technological innovation, automation, and digitalization. These transformations have redefined the competencies required of graduates and

Journal homepage: <http://cahaya-ic.com/index.php/IJoER>

have compelled higher education institutions (HEIs) to reexamine how effectively their curricula prepare students for employability in a technology-driven economy. While HEIs aim to equip learners with both technical and soft skills, persistent mismatches between academic training and labor market demands indicate a pressing need for systematic curriculum evaluation and accountability [1]-[3].

Employers increasingly emphasize that employability extends beyond academic credentials to include transversal competencies such as problem-solving, communication, teamwork, and digital proficiency [3]. Awadhiya [2] argued that employability in the digital era depends on how effectively academic programs embed digital and analytical competencies, while Bhatti et al. [1] underscored that employability skills differ across cultural and educational contexts, highlighting the need for adaptable and innovative curricula. These observations point to the importance of curriculum evaluation frameworks that ensure continuous alignment between educational outcomes and workforce expectations.

In this regard, educational accountability theories and evaluation frameworks provide structured means to assess curriculum effectiveness. The CIPP Evaluation Model developed by Stufflebeam [4] remains one of the most widely adopted approaches for evaluating educational programs, focusing on four dimensions: Context, Input, Process, and Product. The model promotes a comprehensive, decision-oriented evaluation that helps institutions identify needs, assess resources, improve pedagogical processes, and measure learning outcomes. Recent studies emphasize the CIPP model's relevance for assessing employability-oriented programs because it links curricular design with performance indicators and stakeholder feedback [5], [6]. Within this model, curriculum evaluation is not merely summative but formative, supporting accountability, quality assurance, and continuous improvement in educational delivery.

The alignment between curriculum and industry expectations is further reinforced through outcome-based education (OBE) and competency-based frameworks, which prioritize measurable learning results over content coverage [7], [8]. Phan [9] and Scheuring and Thompson [10] demonstrated that experiential and simulation-based learning approaches effectively translate curricular inputs into employability outcomes by enhancing teamwork, problem-solving, and adaptability. Likewise, Rahmaningtyas et al. [11] and Koape and Mamabolo [12] showed that experiential learning develops entrepreneurial and professional competencies that are directly applicable to industry contexts.

In the Philippine setting, higher education institutions continue to face challenges in improving graduate employability and job readiness. Ontiveros-Mendoza [13] highlighted that digital transformation requires Filipino graduates to continually enhance their skills, while Alvarez and Cammayo [14] emphasized integrating sustainability, ethics, and technological proficiency into business programs to meet national development priorities. Curriculum assessment frameworks such as the CIPP model can therefore serve as essential tools for ensuring that business and entrepreneurship programs remain responsive, evidence-based, and accountable to both academic standards and labor market demands.

Employers' feedback also functions as a key performance indicator in curriculum evaluation, serving as "product" evidence in the CIPP framework. Such feedback provides direct insights into graduates' job performance, work attitudes, and transferable skills, helping institutions refine curricula to bridge employability gaps [15]-[17]. By embedding employer perspectives within curriculum assessment systems, HEIs can promote accountability, continuous quality improvement, and sustainable educational relevance in a fast-changing economic environment.

Given this context, the present study employs the CIPP Evaluation Model as a guiding framework to analyze employers' feedback on the job performance of Bachelor of Science in Entrepreneurship graduates of Kalinga State University (KSU). Specifically, it evaluates the context (labor market needs and program goals), input (curricular content and resources), process (teaching and learning strategies), and product (employer-evaluated outcomes) of the program. The findings aim to generate evidence for curriculum enhancement, instructional innovation, and policy formulation toward improved employability and educational accountability.

While numerous studies have examined graduate employability and skills development globally [1]-[3], there remains a limited body of research in the Philippine and broader ASEAN context that systematically links employers' feedback to curriculum evaluation frameworks such as the CIPP model. Existing studies have primarily focused on graduates' self-assessed competencies or tracer studies that measure employment outcomes without integrating these findings into formal curriculum assessment and accountability systems. This gap highlights the need for evaluation models that not only assess graduate performance but also provide actionable insights for curriculum redesign and policy improvement.

Addressing this gap, the present study positions employer feedback as empirical evidence of program effectiveness, serving as the "Product" component in the CIPP framework, and uses it to inform decisions on curricular alignment, pedagogical enhancement, and stakeholder-driven quality assurance. The findings are expected to contribute to educational accountability by offering data-driven recommendations for curriculum enhancement, instructional innovation, and institutional policy formulation.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

2.1. Research Design

The study employed a mixed-methods research design, specifically an explanatory sequential approach, to obtain a comprehensive understanding of the employability and job performance of Bachelor of Science in Entrepreneurship graduates. According to Creswell [18], this design involves two distinct phases, quantitative followed by qualitative, where the latter helps to explain or elaborate on the statistical results derived from the former. In the quantitative phase, a descriptive survey method was used to collect data on graduates' socio-demographic profiles, employment status, and job performance as evaluated by their employers. The results from this phase provided empirical evidence of trends and patterns in graduate outcomes, which served as the foundation for the qualitative phase. Subsequently, semi-structured interviews were conducted with selected employers to gain deeper contextual insights and to solicit recommendations for improving the graduates' competencies and workplace readiness. The integration of quantitative and qualitative data allowed for a more holistic interpretation of the findings, facilitating evidence-based recommendations for curriculum enhancement and career development [19], [20].

2.2. Research Participants

The participants of the study were the employers of our graduates from 2018 to 2022, located within and outside Kalinga Province. A total enumeration sampling technique was used in the quantitative phase, involving all 35 identified employed graduates, with 31 valid responses collected. For the qualitative phase, purposive sampling was employed to select ten (10) employers representing diverse business sectors. These respondents were identified through the tracer study database of the College of Entrepreneurship, Tourism, and Hospitality Management. Their feedback provided valuable qualitative insights into the strengths and improvement areas in graduates' personal, interpersonal, intellectual, and technical competencies.

2.3. Research Instruments

Data collection utilized a structured questionnaire patterned after Shah et al. [20] and modified to align with the study objectives. The questionnaire consists of two parts. Part one gathers the data on the socio-demographic profile of the graduates, and part two evaluates graduates' job performance in terms of personal abilities (14 items), interpersonal abilities (9 items), intellectual abilities (11), and generic and specific knowledge and skills (10).

2.4. Research Procedures

Before administering the questionnaire, the tracer study with the lists of employed BS Entrepreneurship graduates belonging to Batch 2018-2022 was retrieved from the office of the dean of the College of Entrepreneurship, Tourism, and Hospitality Management. Then, the researchers asked for permission through a letter from the owners/heads of the companies/agencies to administer the questionnaires in their respective offices. Then, the researchers personally administered the printed version of the questionnaires to the respondents, and some questionnaires were administered online through Google Forms. The interviews of the 10 respondents for the qualitative data were conducted face-to-face. The data gathered was encoded using Microsoft Excel, and a statistician was consulted for the data analysis. Interpretation of data was done after the consultation.

2.5. Data Analysis

Descriptive statistics such as frequency, percentage, weighted mean, and ranking were used to analyze quantitative data, with responses measured on a 5-point Likert scale. A five-point Likert scale was utilized to quantify the respondents' perceptions and to provide measurable indicators for analyzing the graduates' job performance. This scale enabled the researchers to determine the degree of agreement or disagreement with each statement presented in the survey instrument. The scale ranges from 1.00 to 5.00, with corresponding qualitative descriptions that guide interpretation. A rating of 4.20–5.00 indicates Strongly Agree (SA), suggesting that the attribute or behavior is highly evident among the graduates. The range 3.40–4.19, interpreted as Agree (A), signifies that the characteristic is frequently demonstrated. The scores between 2.60–3.39, labeled as Undecided (UD), reflect a neutral or moderate perception. Ratings of 1.80–2.59 (Disagree [D]) and 1.00–1.79 (Strongly Disagree [SD]) denote low to very low manifestation of the trait or competency being measured. This scaling technique provides a standardized means of interpreting responses, ensuring objectivity and consistency in evaluating the graduates' job performance across the four assessed domains.

The qualitative interview data were analyzed using reflexive thematic analysis following the approach of Braun & Clarke [21]. This method involved systematic processes of familiarization, coding, theme generation, and review to identify patterns that captured employers' perceptions and recommendations for enhancing graduates' competencies. Thematic analysis was chosen for its flexibility and suitability in interpreting qualitative data within mixed-methods research, allowing the integration of employer insights into curriculum improvement and policy recommendations.

2.6. Ethical Considerations

Ethical standards were strictly observed throughout the conduct of this study to ensure the integrity of the research process and the protection of participants' rights. Prior to data collection, formal approval to conduct the study was sought from the Research and Development Office of Kalinga State University. The researcher provided all participants with an informed consent form detailing the study's purpose, procedures, potential benefits, and their rights as participants. Participation was entirely voluntary, and respondents were informed that they could withdraw from the study at any stage without negative consequences.

To maintain confidentiality and anonymity, participants' names and organizational affiliations were not disclosed in the research report. Instead, codes or pseudonyms were used when citing qualitative responses. All survey and interview data were stored securely in password-protected digital files accessible only to the researchers. The collected data were used solely for academic purposes and were destroyed after the completion of the study in accordance with data privacy protocols.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This section presents and interprets the findings of the study based on the data collected from employers of Bachelor of Science in Entrepreneurship graduates of KSU. The results are organized according to the study's major objectives, focusing on the evaluation of graduates' job performance across four domains: personal abilities, interpersonal abilities, intellectual abilities, and generic and specific knowledge and skills. Quantitative results obtained from the descriptive survey are supported and enriched by qualitative insights drawn from employers' comments and suggestions. The discussion highlights key patterns, strengths, and areas for improvement, comparing the findings with relevant literature to establish alignment with industry standards and employability competencies expected in the contemporary business environment.

3.1 Socio-demographic profile of graduates

Table 1. Socio-demographic profiles of graduates

Profile Variable	Category	Frequency (f)	Percentage (%)	Rank
Position	Sales/Marketing Associate	21	67.7	1
	Clerk	8	25.8	2
	Fire Officer	1	3.2	3.5
	Chef	1	3.2	3.5
	Total	31	100	
Employment Status	Contractual	17	54.8	1
	Regular	11	35.5	2
	Job Order	3	9.7	3
	Total	31	100	
Years of Employment	More than three years	14	45.2	1
	1 to 3 years	9	29.0	2
	Less than one year	8	25.8	3
	Total	31	100	
Monthly Salary (in PHP)	10,001–15,000	23	74.2	1
	20,001 and above	5	16.1	2
	10,000 and below	2	6.5	3
	15,001–20,000	1	3.2	4
	Total	31	100	

Table 1 presents the socio-demographic profiles of graduates, with a focus on their employment. It can be inferred from the above table that most graduates hold positions related to sales and marketing (68%) and are in contractual employment status (17%). In addition, most graduates are employed for more than three years (45%) and receive salaries ranging from 10,000 to 15,000 pesos (74%). These imply that job opportunities are available for BS Entrepreneurship graduates that are relevant to their field of study. This implies that the older batch of graduates could secure regular employment shortly after graduation, while the later batches are still in their contractual and job order status, and most of them decide to work rather than start their businesses.

These results align with the findings of Alvarez and Cammayo [14] from Isabela State University, who found that BS Entrepreneurship graduates sought employment relevant to their field of study rather than starting their businesses after graduation.

3.2 Employers' feedback on the job performance of entrepreneurship graduates

Table 2. Employers' feedback on the job performance of BS entrepreneurship graduates based on personal abilities

Indicators	Weighted Mean	Descriptive Equivalent	Rank
1. Openness to feedback and learning from mistakes	4.39	Strongly Agree	7
2. Awareness of personal strengths and weaknesses	4.58	Strongly Agree	4
3. Confidence in taking business risks and managing projects	4.06	Agree	12
4. Ability to exercise restraint and avoid hasty decisions when addressing problems	4.13	Agree	10
5. Maintaining composure and calmness in high-stress situations	4.10	Agree	11
6. Persistence when things do not go as planned	4.65	Strongly Agree	2
7. Desire to perform to the best of one's ability	4.61	Strongly Agree	3
8. Taking ownership of initiatives, including outcomes	4.42	Strongly Agree	6
9. Ability to make tough decisions related to work	3.97	Agree	14
10. Willingness to help with menial tasks at work	4.68	Strongly Agree	1
11. Possessing a sense of humor and the capacity to put work in perspective	4.03	Agree	13
12. Commitment to work ethics	4.45	Strongly Agree	5
13. Commitment to sustainability activities and programs of the organization	4.35	Strongly Agree	8
14. Flexibility and adaptability at work	4.16	Agree	9
Overall Weighted Mean	4.32	Strongly Agree	

Table 2 presents the employers' feedback on the job performance of BS Entrepreneurship graduates in terms of personal abilities. The highest-rated indicators, "willingness to help with menial tasks" (WM = 4.68) and "persistence when things do not go as planned" (WM = 4.65), highlight that graduates demonstrate humility, resilience, and reliability in fulfilling work responsibilities. These qualities reflect a strong internal work ethic and commitment to organizational goals, traits that employers consider fundamental to long-term career success.

This finding aligns with Becker's [22] Human Capital Theory, which posits that personal traits such as persistence and diligence contribute to individuals' economic value and productivity. Graduates' strong work orientation and cooperation represent critical components of employability capital. Similarly, Geng et al. [23] emphasized that persistence, adaptability, and initiative enhance graduates' ability to secure and sustain employment, while Tushar and Sooraksa [3] noted that employers increasingly prioritize diligence and self-management in the digital age.

The relatively lower ratings for "confidence in making tough decisions" (WM = 3.97) and "ability to exercise restraint under pressure" (WM = 4.13) suggest that some graduates still lack independence and confidence in complex or high-stakes decision-making situations. This indicates the need for pedagogical interventions that strengthen graduates' self-efficacy and analytical reasoning. Bandura's [24] Self-Efficacy Theory explains that individuals' confidence in their abilities influences how they approach challenges and persist through obstacles. As Ahmad and Sulaiman [25] observed, decision-making self-efficacy is essential for effective performance in dynamic organizational settings.

Furthermore, Kolb's [26] Experiential Learning Theory supports the idea that critical thinking and judgment are best developed through experiential and reflective learning processes. Embedding business simulations, case analyses, and leadership practicums can help translate theoretical understanding into confident, independent decision-making.

The results affirm that BS Entrepreneurship graduates possess strong personal values, resilience, and work ethics, core indicators of professional maturity. However, the integration of structured reflection and applied leadership training in the curriculum could further develop their decision-making and problem-solving self-efficacy, aligning with the Process and Product dimensions of the CIPP Evaluation Model [4].

Table 3. Employers' feedback on the job performance of BS entrepreneurship graduates based on interpersonal abilities

Indicators	Weighted Mean	Descriptive Equivalent	Rank
1. Ability to relate and collaborate with diverse individuals	4.32	Strongly Agree	4
2. Ability to consider other viewpoints before deciding	3.94	Agree	7
3. Ability to establish and utilize networks of colleagues to address significant workplace issues	4.58	Strongly Agree	2
4. Knowledge of how the different units function and the influence they have in different work scenarios	4.35	Strongly Agree	3
5. Ability to collaborate with seniors without feeling intimidated	4.00	Agree	6
6. Ability to provide constructive feedback to coworkers without blaming them	3.81	Agree	8
7. Ability to inspire others to succeed	4.19	Agree	5
8. Ability to contribute positively to improving team projects	4.74	Strongly Agree	1
9. Having an international perspective	3.35	Agree	9
Overall Weighted Mean	4.15	Agree	

Table 3 shows that employers rated the graduates highly in “ability to contribute positively to improving team projects” (WM = 4.74) and “ability to establish and utilize networks of colleagues” (WM = 4.58), indicating strong collaboration, teamwork, and networking competencies. These results suggest that the experiential learning and practicum opportunities provided in the BS Entrepreneurship program have effectively fostered interpersonal readiness and cooperative attitudes.

The findings are consistent with Kolb's Experiential Learning Theory [26], which emphasizes that social collaboration and reflection enhance professional competence. Obi et al. [27] likewise found that experiential and collaborative learning approaches promote communication, teamwork, and adaptability, competencies that are transferable across organizational contexts.

The lowest-rated indicator, “having an international perspective” (WM = 3.35), points to limited global awareness and cross-cultural exposure. As Di Pietro [28] argued, employers increasingly value globally competent graduates who can adapt to multicultural settings, while Whitsed et al. [29] highlighted the importance of internationalizing the curriculum to prepare students for global engagement. Integrating global business cases, student exchanges, and virtual collaborations could enhance the graduates' intercultural competence.

This further aligns with Goleman's [30] Emotional Intelligence Theory, which identifies empathy and social awareness as essential for effective collaboration and leadership. Graduates' teamwork and networking abilities reflect strong interpersonal and emotional competencies, attributes that strengthen organizational harmony and productivity. Within the CIPP framework, these interpersonal competencies represent the Product of effective pedagogical Processes designed to build teamwork and social capital.

Table 4. Employers' feedback on the job performance of BS entrepreneurship graduates based on intellectual abilities

Indicators	Weighted Mean	Descriptive Equivalent	Rank
1. Awareness that there is no single standard way to solve workplace issues or complete a project	4.23	Strongly Agree	5
2. Ability to recognize the central issue in any circumstance from multiple details	4.06	Agree	8
3. Capability to utilize prior experience to figure out what is going on when a present situation takes an unexpected turn	4.35	Strongly Agree	3.5
4. Ability to diagnose problems and test these in action	4.39	Strongly Agree	2
5. Ability to identify and evaluate various choices and choose the best one	3.97	Agree	10
6. Capacity to modify a course of action in response to developments during implementation	4.13	Agree	7
7. Capacity to discern connections between seemingly unrelated activities and construct a comprehensive picture	4.16	Agree	6
8. Ability to set and justify priorities	3.94	Agree	11
9. Ability to identify patterns within a complex scenario	4.35	Strongly Agree	3.5
10. Being an independent thinker	4.03	Agree	9
11. Demonstrates creativity and entrepreneurial skills	4.52	Strongly Agree	1

Overall Weighted Mean	4.19	Agree
-----------------------	------	-------

As presented in Table 4, the indicator “demonstrates creativity and entrepreneurial skills” received the highest weighted mean (4.52), followed by “ability to diagnose problems and test these in action” (WM = 4.39). These findings suggest that BS Entrepreneurship graduates are capable of applying innovative and analytical thinking to real-world challenges, reflecting the success of the program’s entrepreneurship-oriented curriculum.

This supports Shahab et al. [31], who found that entrepreneurial education enhances innovation, opportunity recognition, and creative problem-solving skills directly linked to employability and business performance. Likewise, Alsos et al. [32] argued that venture-creation learning environments help graduates transfer entrepreneurial competencies to various occupational contexts.

These intellectual strengths are further supported by Mezirow’s [33] Transformative Learning Theory, which emphasizes reflective and critical thinking as outcomes of higher education. The graduates’ ability to recognize patterns and use prior experience to manage unexpected situations (WM = 4.35) reflects transformative learning outcomes that promote adaptive reasoning and self-reflection.

However, the relatively lower rating in “ability to set and justify priorities” (WM = 3.94) reveals an area for improvement in strategic and managerial thinking. Abbasi et al. [6] emphasized that prioritization and strategic decision-making are critical managerial competencies that should be reinforced in business programs. Embedding project management and leadership simulations could strengthen these intellectual abilities.

These results affirm the CIPP Model’s “Process–Product” relationship, where active, reflective, and problem-based pedagogies (Process) produce graduates with enhanced analytical and entrepreneurial competencies (Product).

Table 5. Employers’ feedback on the job performance of BS entrepreneurship graduates based on generic and specific knowledge and skills

Indicators	Weighted Mean	Descriptive Equivalent	Rank
1. Technical expertise relevant to current work requirements	3.65	Agree	9
2. Knowledge about risk management and litigation, and how it affects professional work	3.77	Agree	8
3. Understanding how organizations operate	4.23	Strongly Agree	2
4. Ability to communicate and accomplish vital functions using IT effectively	3.94	Agree	5
5. Ability to manage professional growth and development	3.84	Agree	7
6. Ability to facilitate and actively engage in productive meetings	3.48	Agree	10
7. Ability to communicate effectively	3.87	Agree	6
8. Knowledge in managing projects for successful implementation	3.97	Agree	4
9. Helping others learn in the workplace	4.19	Strongly Agree	3
10. Ability to organize work	4.26	Strongly Agree	1
Overall Weighted Mean	3.92	Agree	

Table 5 reveals that “ability to organize work” (WM = 4.26) and “understanding how organizations operate” (WM = 4.23) are the strongest indicators, suggesting that graduates are competent in operational planning, organizational awareness, and teamwork. Employers view these skills as essential for workplace efficiency and adaptability.

This finding echoes Becker’s [22] Human Capital Theory, which links systematic organizational understanding and skill mastery to higher productivity and employability. In addition, the findings affirm that employers highly value graduates who combine organizational and operational knowledge with collaborative behavior. Mehrotra and Elias [34] noted that employers prioritize business graduates with generic skills in communication, coordination, and teamwork, which contribute directly to organizational effectiveness. Likewise, Obioha and Sotshangane [35] emphasized that both generic and occupation-specific competencies enable graduates to adapt across sectors and function effectively in varied professional roles.

Conversely, the lowest-rated indicator, “ability to facilitate and actively engage in productive meetings” (WM = 3.48), although still interpreted as Agree, highlights an area for improvement. Employers expect graduates not only to participate but also to lead and contribute meaningfully to discussions, demonstrating confidence, clarity, and leadership in professional communication. This finding suggests that integrating presentation, facilitation, and negotiation exercises into entrepreneurship courses could further strengthen graduates’ managerial and communication skills.

Within the lens of Kolb’s Experiential Learning Theory [26], these outcomes reflect how practical experiences, internships, and project-based learning transform theoretical knowledge into applied organizational skills.

Overall, the results imply that BS Entrepreneurship graduates exhibit commendable organizational and interpersonal proficiency but would benefit from enhanced training in meeting facilitation and leadership communication to meet the dynamic expectations of modern workplaces.

3.3 Employers' perspectives on the specific training and learning interventions needed to enhance graduates' personal, interpersonal, intellectual, and technical competencies for improved workplace performance.

Employers' qualitative feedback provided valuable insights into the areas that require strengthening among BS Entrepreneurship graduates of Kalinga State University. Thematic analysis of interview data revealed four dominant themes: (1) Practical and Experiential Learning, (2) Communication and Interpersonal Development, (3) Technological and Digital Skills Enhancement, and (4) Leadership and Professional Competence.

Practical and Experiential Learning

A recurring theme among employers was the need for more hands-on and experiential training to enhance graduates' decision-making and independence at work. Participant 1 emphasized that *"students should be given more practical experience in business management and decision making so they can be more independent in their work without much supervision."* Employers observed that while graduates demonstrate enthusiasm and willingness to learn, additional exposure to real-world entrepreneurial operations, through practicums, simulations, and case-based learning, would further strengthen their readiness for employment. Participant 10 likewise recommended that *"the university should give more exposure to students to improve their entrepreneurial and marketing skills."* These statements highlight the importance of integrating experiential learning components into the curriculum to bridge theory and practice.

These findings align with recent studies emphasizing the transformative impact of experiential learning on employability and workplace readiness. Rahmaningtyas et al. [11] found that internship and work-integrated learning programs significantly enhance graduates' employability skills, while Scheuring and Thompson [10] demonstrated that business simulation activities foster problem-solving and teamwork, two critical attributes demanded by employers. Similarly, Phan [9] concluded that experiential approaches bridge the gap between classroom theory and actual business practice, cultivating students' autonomy and professional confidence.

Communication and Interpersonal Development

Another dominant concern was the graduates' limited communication confidence, particularly in customer interactions and professional settings. Participant 2 noted that *"students should be trained in how to speak more confidently so they can better engage with customers,"* further remarking in the local dialect that *"Haan da kuma nga agbabain nga sumango ti customers"* (they are still shy to approach customers). Participant 6 similarly emphasized that *"students should practice speaking in English so they cannot have difficulty in dealing with foreign clients."* Employers also suggested additional training in interpersonal skills and business etiquette to enhance students' capacity to interact effectively with diverse clients. These findings suggest that strengthening oral communication and interpersonal engagement training can promote graduates' confidence, adaptability, and customer relations proficiency.

These insights are consistent with the findings identifying communication as a core employability skill. Tushar and Sooraksa [3] and Mainga et al. [36] reported that employers across industries consistently prioritize communication, teamwork, and problem-solving as key graduate competencies. Furthermore, Chan [37] highlighted that business graduates often exhibit communication gaps, especially in formal client interactions, which can be addressed through targeted communication and interpersonal training programs.

Technological and Digital Skills Enhancement

Employers consistently emphasized the importance of technological literacy in today's business environment. Participant 3 remarked that *"since computers are being used today in organizations, students should learn how to encode, print, and prepare business documents so they can perform more efficiently and effectively at work."* Similarly, Participant 8 observed that *"graduates lack computer skills and simple accounting skills,"* while Participant 5 suggested that technology should be used to improve customer service delivery. These statements underscore the need for curricular enrichment in computer applications, digital marketing, and basic accounting systems to align with the technological demands of modern business enterprises. Enhancing these competencies will ensure that graduates remain competitive and responsive to evolving workplace requirements.

This need for stronger digital and technical competence is widely supported by recent literature. Tee et al. [38] reported significant skill mismatches between graduates' digital capabilities and employers' expectations, noting that proficiency in digital communication, online collaboration, and productivity tools is now fundamental. Smith [39] further identified that digital content creation, data literacy, and digital communication are indispensable for employment in knowledge-based industries. Đorđević et al. [40] also found

that higher levels of digital competence strongly correlate with improved job placement and performance, reinforcing the importance of embedding digital and technological training into business education curricula.

Leadership and Professional Competence

While employers described the graduates as dependable and diligent, they also expressed the need to cultivate leadership potential and time management skills. Participant 4 pointed out that “*graduates’ performance could become even better if they are also trained in leadership roles since they are expected to become supervisors or managers.*” Likewise, Participant 9 recommended addressing weaknesses in “*time management and communication skills.*” These findings highlight the necessity of embedding leadership development, problem-solving, and managerial training within the BS Entrepreneurship curriculum. Such initiatives will prepare graduates not only as effective employees but also as future entrepreneurs and business leaders.

These findings correspond with current studies highlighting leadership and self-management as essential graduate attributes. Awadhiya [2] revealed that 21st-century skills, particularly leadership, decision-making, and self-regulation, are increasingly sought by employers in business and IT sectors. Bhatti et al. [1] also found that creativity, leadership, and self-management significantly predict employability among business graduates. Furthermore, Koape and Mamabolo [12] emphasized that leadership and critical thinking are central to preparing graduates for managerial roles in global organizations.

Overall, employers’ feedback revealed that while BS Entrepreneurship graduates possess fundamental competencies in sales and dependability, there remain areas for improvement in practical experience, communication confidence, technological proficiency, and leadership capability. These findings point to the need for a more holistic and integrative curriculum that emphasizes experiential learning, communication training, digital literacy, and leadership development. Strengthening these domains will enhance graduates’ employability and align their competencies with industry expectations.

3.4. Implications for curriculum evaluation

The findings of this study carry significant implications for curriculum evaluation, particularly within the framework of the CIPP Model (Context–Input–Process–Product) proposed by Stufflebeam [4]. Employers’ consistently positive feedback on the graduates’ personal, interpersonal, intellectual, and professional abilities demonstrates that the BS Entrepreneurship curriculum of Kalinga State University is largely effective in producing employable and ethically grounded graduates. However, certain gaps, such as moderate confidence in decision-making, limited global perspective, and insufficient facilitation and leadership communication skills, underscore the continuing need for systematic, evidence-based curriculum assessment and enhancement.

Within the Context dimension, the results suggest that entrepreneurship curricula should be continually aligned with the changing labor market dynamics and national as well as regional development priorities. In the ASEAN region, these priorities are articulated in the ASEAN Qualifications Reference Framework (AQRF) and the ASEAN Work Plan on Education 2021–2025, both emphasizing the development of human capital that is globally competitive, adaptable, and innovation-driven. Embedding these principles into curriculum evaluation ensures that academic programs contribute not only to local employability but also to regional labor mobility and mutual recognition of qualifications.

For the Input component, the study reinforces the need to integrate core competencies such as persistence, adaptability, ethics, and digital literacy, attributes that reflect the ASEAN 21st-century skills framework. Investment in faculty development, digital pedagogy, and international industry partnerships can further strengthen instructional inputs that enhance employability. These efforts resonate with the ASEAN vision of producing graduates who can thrive in interconnected and technology-enabled work environments.

Regarding the Process dimension, the results advocate for greater use of experiential learning strategies, business simulations, practicum engagements, and intercultural collaborations that connect theory to practice. Such experiential processes are central to ASEAN’s goal of fostering innovation, entrepreneurship, and inclusive education. As Kolb’s [26] Experiential Learning Theory posits, learning through experience enhances decision-making and reflective practice, key areas where graduates require further strengthening.

Under the Product dimension, employers’ feedback provides meaningful and actionable data that can inform institutional assessment and accountability systems. By incorporating employer evaluations into periodic program reviews, higher education institutions uphold transparency and relevance in curriculum delivery. This feedback-driven evaluation aligns with the ASEAN emphasis on Outcome-Based Education (OBE) and Quality Assurance frameworks, which advocate for evidence-based curriculum decisions guided by stakeholder input and measurable learning outcomes [41].

The implications of this study extend beyond institutional curriculum improvement to regional educational accountability. The integration of employer perspectives within the CIPP framework demonstrates how HEIs can contribute to the ASEAN agenda of quality-assured, harmonized, and competency-based higher education. For Kalinga State University, this entails not only producing employable graduates but also

participating in the collective ASEAN mission of cultivating a future-ready, innovative, and globally competent workforce that supports sustainable socio-economic growth across Southeast Asia.

4. CONCLUSION

The study concludes that BS Entrepreneurship graduates of Kalinga State University exhibit commendable levels of job performance across the four domains of personal abilities, interpersonal abilities, intellectual abilities, and generic and specific knowledge and skills. Employers' strong agreement on indicators such as willingness to assist with menial tasks, persistence amid challenges, and collaboration in team projects reflects graduates' professionalism, resilience, and strong ethical grounding. Their creativity, problem-solving ability, and entrepreneurial mindset demonstrate the program's success in cultivating graduates who can translate academic learning into innovative and productive workplace performance.

However, areas for improvement were identified in strategic decision-making, international perspective, and facilitation in professional meetings, skills that are increasingly vital in globally connected and technology-driven business environments. These results suggest that while graduates possess the foundational attributes of employability, enhancing their confidence in leadership, cross-cultural competence, and communication should be prioritized through targeted curriculum enhancement.

Employing the CIPP (Context–Input–Process–Product) Evaluation Model, this study positions employers' feedback as credible evidence of curriculum effectiveness and institutional accountability. The results emphasize that entrepreneurship education must remain adaptive to labor market needs, continuously integrating stakeholder input to ensure quality and relevance.

Within the ASEAN context, these findings resonate with the ASEAN Qualifications Reference Framework (AQRF) and the ASEAN Work Plan on Education 2021–2025, which advocate for outcome-based education, employability enhancement, and regional harmonization of qualifications. The use of the CIPP model as an evaluative lens contributes to ASEAN's goal of strengthening quality assurance and curriculum accountability across higher education systems. By integrating employer feedback into curriculum evaluation, Kalinga State University contributes to ASEAN's collective mission of building a future-ready, innovative, and globally competent workforce that supports sustainable and inclusive economic development in the region.

Future research may build on these findings by conducting comparative evaluations across universities within the Philippines and other ASEAN member states to identify best practices in entrepreneurship education and employability alignment. Longitudinal studies may also be undertaken to trace graduates' career trajectories and entrepreneurial ventures over time, offering deeper insights into the long-term impact of curriculum interventions. Additionally, future studies could incorporate the perspectives of other stakeholders, students, faculty, and policymakers, to create a more holistic framework for curriculum evaluation and accountability. Such efforts would strengthen the evidence base for policy reforms and further advance the regional agenda of educational quality, innovation, and sustainable human capital development.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The researchers would like to extend their heartfelt gratitude to all employers of our graduates for their valuable time, insights, and cooperation throughout the conduct of this study. Their active participation and honest responses greatly contributed to the success and meaningful outcomes of this research.

REFERENCES

- [1] M. A. Bhatti, S. A. M. Saat, M. M. Aleidan, G. H. M. Al Murshidi, M. Alyahya, and A. S. Juhari, "Are business graduates' employability skills and learning/teaching techniques universal? Exploring the role of culture: A comparative study among Australia, China, Pakistan, and Saudi Arabia," *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, vol. 14, no. 5, Mar. 2022, doi: 10.3390/su14053069.
- [2] A. K. Awadhiya, "Employability Skills in IT Sector: What matters most for graduate success?," *International Journal of Changes in Education*, Feb. 2025, doi: 10.47852/bonviewijce52024010.
- [3] H. Tushar and N. Sooraksa, "Global employability skills in the 21st century workplace: A semi-systematic literature review," *Heliyon*, vol. 9, no. 11, Nov. 2023, doi: 10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e21023.
- [4] D. L. Stufflebeam, "The relevance of the CIPP evaluation model for educational accountability," 1971.
- [5] S. Sankaran and N. Saad, "Evaluating the Bachelor of Education Program Based on the Context, Input, Process, and Product Model," *Front Educ (Lausanne)*, vol. 7, Jun. 2022, doi: 10.3389/educ.2022.924374.
- [6] F. K. Abbasi, A. Ali, and N. Bibi, "Analysis of skill gap for business graduates: managerial perspective from banking industry," *Education and Training*, vol. 60, no. 4, pp. 354–367, Apr. 2018, doi: 10.1108/ET-08-2017-0120.
- [7] Fathima Nasreen; Siti Hajar Halili; Rafiza Abdul Razak, "Employability skills of Malaysian university students for IR4.0: A systematic literature review," vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 15–28, 2022.
- [8] S. Sankaran and N. Saad, "Evaluating the Bachelor of Education Program Based on the Context, Input, Process, and Product Model," *Front Educ (Lausanne)*, vol. 7, Jun. 2022, doi: 10.3389/educ.2022.924374.

- [9] N. Phan, "Bridging the Gap: A Framework for Experiential Learning in Higher Education," *Business and Professional Communication Quarterly*, 2024, doi: 10.1177/23294906241292009.
- [10] F. Scheuring and J. Thompson, "Enhancing graduate employability—exploring the influence of experiential simulation learning on life skill development," *Studies in Higher Education*, vol. 50, no. 2, pp. 256–270, 2025, doi: 10.1080/03075079.2024.2334837.
- [11] W. Rahmaningtyas, S. Joyoatmojo, C. D. S. Indrawati, and T. Murwaningsih, "Graduate Satisfaction: How Experiential Learning Supercharges Employability Skills," *Asian Journal of University Education*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 160–176, 2025, doi: 10.24191/ajue.v21i1.5447.
- [12] M. Koape and A. Mamabolo, "The effect of experiential learning on entrepreneurial competencies and business performance," vol. 29, no. 2, Jul. 2024, doi: 10.1142/S1084946724500109.
- [13] E. Ontiveros -Mendoza, "Employers' Feedback on the Quality of Work and Workplace Performance: Inputs to Career Development Strategies," *Asia Pacific Journal of Education Perspective*, vol. 8, no. 2, pp. 10–17, 2021.
- [14] M. T. S. Alvarez and E. U. Cammayo, "A graduate's employability study of bachelor of science in entrepreneurship of Isabela State University, Philippines," *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education*, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 164–173, Mar. 2023, doi: 10.11591/ijere.v12i1.22841.
- [15] F. T. G. Gaite, R. A. Arroyo, P. J. Lim, P. M. E. Vergara, and J. A. Doria, "Employers' Feedback on Job Performance of Hotel and Restaurant Management Graduates," *International Journal of Academe and Industry Research*, vol. 3, no. 4, pp. 129–144, Dec. 2022, doi: 10.53378/352944.
- [16] B. P. Ping Yong and Y.-L. Ling, "Skills Gap: The Perceptions of Importance of Soft Skills in Graduate Employability Between Employers and Graduates," *Journal of Techno-Social*, vol. 15, no. 1, Jun. 2023, doi: 10.30880/jts.2023.15.01.002.
- [17] J. M. Aquino and J. Garcia, "Feedback on Technical, Organizational, and Customer Service Skills of Employers of the Automotive Technology Graduates of One State University in the Philippines," *Journal of Mathematics Instruction, Social Research and Opinion*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 129–144, May 2023, doi: 10.58421/misro.v2i2.87.
- [18] J. W. Creswell, *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*, 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2009.
- [19] J. Schoonenboom and R. B. Johnson, "How to Construct a Mixed Methods Research Design," *Kolner Z Soz Sozpsychol*, vol. 69, no. Suppl 2, p. 107, Oct. 2017, doi: 10.1007/S11577-017-0454-1.
- [20] M. Shah, L. Grebennikov, and C. Sid Nair, "A decade of study on employer feedback on the quality of university graduates," *Quality Assurance in Education*, vol. 23, no. 3, pp. 262–278, Jul. 2015, doi: 10.1108/QAE-04-2014-0018.
- [21] V. Braun and V. Clarke, "Using thematic analysis in psychology," *Qual Res Psychol*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 77–101, 2006, doi: 10.1191/1478088706QP063OA
- [22] G. S. . Becker, *Human capital : A theoretical and empirical analysis, with special reference to education*. NBER, 1975.
- [23] L. Geng, M. Ma, R. Osei-Kyei, X. Jin, and S. Shrestha, "A review of employability skills for graduates in the construction sector," 2025, *Emerald Publishing*. doi: 10.1108/HESWBL-08-2024-0242.
- [24] A. Bandura, "Self-efficacy: Toward a unifying theory of behavioral change," *Psychol Rev*, vol. 84, no. 2, pp. 191–215, Mar. 1977, doi: 10.1037/0033-295X.84.2.191.
- [25] N. S. Ahmad and A. A. M. Sulaiman, "The Influence of Personality Traits, Rationality, And Self-Efficacy Towards Decision-Making Styles Among Technical Trainees," *Journal of Technical Education and Training*, vol. 14, no. 3, pp. 60–67, Dec. 2022, doi: 10.30880/jtet.2022.14.03.006.
- [26] D. A. Kolb, "Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development," *J Organ Behav*, vol. 8, no. 4, pp. 359–360, 1984.
- [27] B. I. N. Obi, T. I. Eze, and N. F. Chibuzo, "Experiential learning activities in business education for developing 21st century competencies," *Journal of Education for Business*, vol. 97, no. 1, pp. 36–42, 2022, doi: 10.1080/08832323.2021.1884521.
- [28] G. Di Pietro, "International internships and skill development: A systematic review," *Review of Education*, vol. 10, no. 2, Aug. 2022, doi: 10.1002/rev3.3363.
- [29] C. Whitted, M. Burgess, and S. Ledger, "Editorial Advisory Board Members on Reimagining Higher Education Internationalization and Internationalization of the Curriculum," *J Stud Int Educ*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 348–368, Sep. 2021, doi: 10.1177/1028315320984840.
- [30] D. Goleman Bloomsbury, *Emotional Intelligence: Why It Can Matter More than IQ*. New York: Bantam Books, 1995.
- [31] Y. Shahab, Y. Chengang, A. D. Arbizu, and M. J. Haider, "Entrepreneurial self-efficacy and intention: do entrepreneurial creativity and education matter?," *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour and Research*, vol. 25, no. 2, pp. 259–280, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1108/IJEBR-12-2017-0522.
- [32] G. Alsos *et al.*, "Graduates of venture creation programs – where do they apply their entrepreneurial competencies?," *Small Business Economics*, vol. 60, no. 1, pp. 133–155, Jan. 2023, doi: 10.1007/s11187-022-00641-6.
- [33] J. Mezirow, "Transformative Learning: Theory to Practice," *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, vol. 1997, no. 74, pp. 5–12, Jun. 1997, doi: 10.1002/ACE.7401.
- [34] A. Mehrotra and H. Elias, "Employer's Feedback on Business Graduates," *Journal of WEI Business and Economics*, vol. 6, no. 2, 2017.
- [35] E. Obioha and Y. Sotshangane, "Perspectives on employers' expectations on tertiary education graduates' employability skills in Eastern Cape, South Africa," *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science (2147- 4478)*, vol. 11, no. 5, pp. 237–248, Jun. 2022, doi: 10.20525/ijrbs.v11i5.1832.
- [36] W. Mainga, M. B. M. Braynen, R. Moxey, and S. A. Quddus, "Graduate Employability of Business Students," *Adm Sci*, vol. 12, no. 3, Sep. 2022, doi: 10.3390/admsci12030072.
- [37] V. Chan, "Bridging the Gap: Examining the Discrepancies in Communication Skills Between University Education and Employer Expectations," *Honors Theses*, vol. 3885, 2024.

- [38] P. K. Tee, B. L. Song, M. K. Ho, L. C. Wong, and K. Y. Lim, "Bridging the gaps in digital skills: Employer insights on digital skill demands, micro-credentials, and graduate employability," *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, vol. 8, no. 9, 2024, doi: 10.24294/jipd.v8i9.7313.
- [39] C. Smith, "Bridging the Digital Skills Gap with a Focused Student Initiative," *Pedagogy: LTEC Learning and Teaching Showcase*, vol. 1, no. 1, 2025, doi: 10.57898/pedagogy.267.
- [40] B. Đorđević, S. Milanović Zbiljić, and M. Radosavljević, "Impact of the Digital Skills on Employability: Cross-Sectional Analysis," *Economies*, vol. 13, no. 7, Jul. 2025, doi: 10.3390/economies13070196.
- [41] ASEAN, "ASEAN Qualifications Reference Framework," ASEAN Main Portal, Jul. 28, 2023.